

COUNCIL ORDER No. 0015490

BEFORE THE BUILDING SUB-COUNCIL

On November 7, 2018

IN THE MATTER OF the Safety Codes Act, Revised Statutes of Alberta 2000, Chapter S-1.

AND IN THE MATTER OF the Order Pursuant to Section 49(1)(a) of the Safety Codes Act, R.S.A. 2000 c. S-1 (see Appendix 1), issued July 19, 2018 by the Accredited Municipality ("Respondent") against the property owner ("Appellant") relating to the subject property located in Alberta ("subject property").

UPON HEARING the testimony of witnesses and considering the evidence submitted at and following the hearing; AND UPON REVIEWING AND CONSIDERING the materials submitted including the Issued Order and the arguments made by the parties; THIS COUNCIL ORDERS THAT the Order is VARIED

FROM

Property Owner: the Appellant (Property Owner at the time order was issued)

- **1**. Until such time as demolition is complete, to maintain the condition as set out in the Safety Codes Order dated November 2, 2017;
- 2. To obtain a demolition permit from the Respondent; and
- **3**. To demolish the structure, including removal of the foundation, and clear and level the site to adjacent grades.

Property Owners: the Appellant (party identified as 'owner' at the hearing)

New Owner (current owner on record)

- **1**. Continue to comply with the order of 2 November 2017 as follows:
 - 1.1 Vacate the dwelling located on the Property IMMEDIATELY, including to ensure that all occupants are vacated from the dwelling.
 - 1.2 Ensure no person enters or occupies the dwelling at any time until the dwelling has been deemed safe and the Respondent has issued an occupancy permit.
 - 1.3 Maintain the building in a secure state until the dwelling has been deemed safe and the Respondent has issued an occupancy permit.
- **2**. Ensure the property is fenced on <u>all</u> sides to prevent persons from entering the premises;

AND EITHER

3. Apply for a demolition permit with the Respondent and demolish the structure, including removal of the foundation, and clear and level the site to adjacent grades by 01 March 2019;

OR

- **4**. Submit complete application satisfactory to the Respondent for required permits for all alterations and/or additions to the interior and exterior of the building and structure(s) by 01 March 2019.
 - 4.1 Retain a Professional Engineer, acceptable to the Respondent and registered in the Province of Alberta, to provide a full structural report on the structural integrity of the entire building on the subject property and to be the registered professional of record to complete all design work and field review of all structural repair work required to the building in full compliance with Article 2.4.3.1, Division C of the Alberta Building Code 2014 (see Appendix 2).
 - 4.2 Provide a copy of this Order to the Professional Engineer at the time of such retainer.
 - 4.3 Provide the Professional Engineer with copies of the reports dated 10 June 2018 and 25 November 2017 as information and for safety reasons while inspecting the building.
 - 4.4 Instruct the Professional Engineer that the structural report shall:
 - 4.4.1 Acknowledge that the Engineer was provided with a copy of this Order, and the aforementioned Engineer's reports, prior to the inspection of the subject building and preparation of the report.
 - 4.4.2 Acknowledge that the Engineer was not restricted in performing inspection of the subject building including any invasive testing required to ascertain the structural integrity of the buildings components and prepare a structural report.

- 4.4.3 Provide the Engineer's professional opinion on the structural integrity of the entire building, with specific comment on the individual components thereof (including the foundation, support structure, ceiling, floors, and roof.)
 - 4.4.4 Be affixed with the Engineer's signature and professional seal.
- 4.4.5 Be accompanied by the Engineer's detailed design repair method, complete with drawings and plans in full compliance with the Alberta Building Code 2014 (including but not limited to Article 2.2.2.1 (1), (2), (3) & (4), Division C) (see Appendix 3) for all repairs required to ensure that the building is structurally safe in compliance with the Alberta Building Code 2014, and also be affixed with the Engineer's signature and professional stamp and seal.
- 4.4.6 Be accompanied by completed Schedules A-2, B-1 and B-2 required by Article 2.4.3.1, Division C of the Alberta Building Code 2014 (See Appendix 2) confirming the Engineer has been retained as the registered professional of record for all design work and field review.
- 4.4.7 Be forwarded by copy directly from the Engineer to the owner of the subject property.
- 4.4.8 Conform to all items of sub-section 4.4. of this report and the original be submitted to the Respondent.
- 4.5 Obtain the Respondent's written approval and directions prior to making any application for a building permit for repairs to the building to the Building Permitting section of the Planning and Development Department of the Accredited Municipality or commencing any repairs. (See section 22 of the Permit Regulation in Appendix 4.)
- 4.6 Comply with Article 2.2.13.3, Division C of the Alberta Building Code 2014 (see Appendix 5) by providing the Respondent with written confirmation from any prospective purchaser of the property prior to any disposition or transfer of the property, that the prospective purchaser has been provided with a copy of this Order and acknowledges that they will be subject to the conditions, obligations and deadlines imposed by this Order.

If you do not comply with this Order by 01 March 2019 pursuant to Section 55 of the *Safety Codes Act*, the Respondent may take all necessary steps to enforce the Order.

Reasons for the Decision

Introduction:

1. The Appeal concerns the structure located on the Appellant's property (see paragraphs 23–25) which the Respondent, on reasonable and probable grounds, believes constitutes an unsafe condition which may pose a risk of danger or serious injury or damage to a person or property.

Appearances, Preliminary, Evidentiary, or Procedural Matters:

- **2.** Appearing for the Appellant, the Appeal Panel ("Panel") heard from the legal counsel for the Appellant; and the Appellant's Contractor.
- **3.** Appearing for the Respondent, the Panel heard from the legal counsel for the Respondent; and a Professional Engineer retained by the Respondent.
- **4.** Attending as observers were the owner of the subject property; the Appellant's supporter; a representative from the Accredited Municipality; and two individuals from the Safety Codes Council ("Council") attending for educational purposes.
- **5.** At the commencement of the hearing, the Appellant and Respondent confirmed there were no objections to any members of the Panel, and that the Council in general and the Panel in particular had jurisdiction to hear and decide the appeal.
- **6.** The Appeal Panel Chair ("Chair") then explained the process to be followed in hearing the appeal, and asked the parties to confirm whether there are any objections to The Record (Paragraph 7 below, items 1) to 5). The Appellant and Respondent confirmed that there were no objections to any of the written materials submitted to the Panel prior to the hearing.

The Record:

- **7.** The Panel considered, or had available for reference, the following documentation received prior to the hearing:
 - 1. Notice of appeal and a request for a stay of order
 - 2. Acknowledgment letter dated August 28, 2018
 - 3. Stay of order letter dated August 28, 2018
 - 4. Appeal hearing Brief from the Appellant
 - 5. Appeal hearing Brief from the Respondent
- **8.** The Panel considered the following documentation received after the hearing:
 - 1. Correspondence on title change received from the Respondent on November 7, 2018
 - 2. Acknowledgement letter sent by the Council on November 27, 2018 seeking additional information from the parties including the new owner
 - 3. Written submission and supporting documents from the Respondent received on December 3, 2018

- 4. Supplemental submissions of the Appellant and the new owner received on December 10, 2018
- 5. Follow-up correspondence from the Respondent received on December 11, 2018

Position of the Parties

Appellant's

- **9.** It is the position of the Appellant that the order is unreasonable. The Appellant is seeking a decision that varies or sets aside the order and they want the Panel to make a decision within their authority which is in line with safety. The written submissions provide substantive background evidence demonstrating the Appellant's efforts and willingness to restore the subject property to a state that complies with the Alberta Building Code 2014.
- **10.** The Appellant agrees the property is not safe in its current state. The question is, how can Code compliance be achieved? Hundreds of e-mails have been exchanged with the Respondent discussing what might be done to resolve this matter.
- **11.** The Appellant's Contractor provided information on the subject property history dating back to 2013 and confirmed that the former owner did extensive work without the necessary permits.
- **12.** When the Appellant's Contractor wanted to apply for the permits to do the work on the property, they were advised that for drywall and stucco a permit is not required.
- **13.** The Appellant retained a Professional Engineer to do the drawings for the foundation and roofline. Drawings and Schedules were provided to the Respondent, but unfortunately the Engineer passed away, so the Appellant had to retain another Professional Engineer to provide drawings to the Respondent. The Panel was asked to note the <u>Conclusions</u> portion of the latter Professional Engineer's report confirming everything could be fixed.
- **14.** The Appellant's Contractor emphasized that the Appellant did everything possible to obtain the necessary permits to bring the subject property into compliance with the Code, and that it is not up to the Respondent to make a decision about the financial feasibility.
- **15.** The Appellant's Contractor advised that a plan to bring the subject property up to code was presented by the former Professional Engineer retained by the Appellant, and at the time the Respondent issued a Development Permit, suggesting that indeed the plan was feasible.
- **16.** The Appellant confirmed that the property is still vacant and secure with the exception of fencing. The property is not fenced on all sides, allowing access through a neighbouring property. It is inspected and cleaned up regularly. All utilities have been turned off.

Respondent's

17. It is the position of the Respondent that the issue in front of the Panel is the structural integrity of the Appellant's property, not the conduct of the Accredited Municipality.

Demolition seems to be the most reasonable option as the subject property is substantially deteriorated, and the Appellant has not submitted an alternative plan. The Panel must make a decision about what is the appropriate outcome regarding the order, based upon the two engineers' reports and statements of the Professional Engineer present at the hearing.

- **18.** Professional Engineer retained by the Respondent, who has extensive experience in structural engineering received a call from an individual with the Accredited Municipality requesting an assessment of the subject property. The Respondent retained them for an unbiased reference to the condition of the building.
- 19. The Respondent's Engineer thoroughly reviewed their draft engineering report verbally to the Panel, commenting on the structural concerns captured in the pictures. The Engineer explained that building evaluation was done visually no invasive testing was performed. They also named some of the concerns that must be addressed should the Appellant choose to bring the building up to the current Alberta Building Code 2014. While demolition in this case did not seem unreasonable to the Engineer, they concurred that anything can be restored with the right amount of money and effort.
- **20.** The decision to issue the Order of July 19, 2018 was made solely on the basis of the two engineering reports already referenced and no assessment was made of the cost of remediation, nor was an appraisal of the value of the property undertaken.
- **21.** Reference in the report at Tab 17 of the Respondent's submission to the "feasibility" of bringing the building up to Code is structural not financial.
- **22.** The Respondent is open to considering a plan to bring the building up to Code if one is presented.

Findings of the Appeal Panel:

The Appeal Panel makes the following findings:

- **23.** Upon conclusion of the hearing, the Council received additional information from the Respondent advising of the subject property title transfer on November 2, 2018 from the Appellant to a numbered company. As a result the Panel invited legal counsel for all parties, including the new owner, to respond to this additional evidence.
- **24.** It is clear from the responses that the new owner does not wish to relitigate the proceedings or re-open the evidentiary portion of the hearing, does not seek to introduce new evidence and adopts the agruments of the new owner with a willingness to step into th Appellant's shoes for the purpose of this proceeding.
- **25.** All parties, including the new owner, agree that it is within the scope of the Council to vary an order which may include adding a party to an order; therefore, the numbered company of which the new property owner is a Director, now forms part of the order.
- **26.** The order issued 2 November 2017 with excerpts below remains in effect.

- Vacate the dwelling located on the Property IMMEDIATELY, including to ensure that all
 occupants are vacated from the dwelling.
- Ensure no person enters or occupies the dwelling at any time until the dwelling has been deemed safe and the Respondent has issued an occupancy permit.
- Maintain the building in a secure state until the dwelling has been deemed safe and the Respondent has issued an occupancy permit.
- **27.** While the March 22, 2018 report from the Respondent's Engineer is marked "Draft" and does not have the Engineer's stamp, the Engineer's testimony at the hearing confirms that it remains their professional opinion.
- **28.** An unsafe condition remains in effect, based on the engineers' reports and the Respondent's Engineer's testimony.
- **29.** The order of 19 July 2018 is unreasonable as it makes the assumption that the scope of repairs will exceed the value of the existing structure and is not supported by evidence. The decision of feasibility to bring the subject property up to the Alberta Building Code 2014 is one that rests with the Appellant and not with the safety codes officer issuing the order.
- **30.** Further evaluation by an engineering firm will enable the Appellant to make a decision on the feasibility of bringing the building up to Code and there is a willingness by the Appellant to do so.
- **31.** The Respondent erred by not giving the Appellant the option to determine the feasibility of bringing the building up to Code.
- **32.** Both parties expressed a willingness to work together to achieve this end, recognizing that the end result may be that the building cannot be made safe and may ultimately have to be demolished.

Signed at the City Edmonton)		
in the Province of Alberta)		
this 19 th Day of December A.D. 2018)		

Chair, Building Sub-Council Appeal Panel

Provisions of the Safety Codes Act:

The Safety Codes Act (S-1, RSA 2000), as amended provides, inter alia:

Part 5

Orders, Appeals

Order

49(1) A safety codes officer may issue an order if the safety codes officer believes, on reasonable and probable grounds, that

a) this Act is contravened.

Provisions of the 2014 Alberta Building Code:

The Alberta Building Code 2014 provides, inter alia:

Division C 2.4.3. Schedules of Professional Involvement 2.4.3.1. Owner

- 1) Before beginning construction, the *owner* shall
 - a) retain a coordinating registered professional to coordinate all design work and field reviews of the registered professionals required for the project in order to ascertain that
 - i)the design will comply with this Code and other regulations made pursuant to the Safety Codes Act, and
 - ii) the construction of the *project* will substantially comply with this Code and other regulations made pursuant to the Safety Codes Act,
 - b) retain registered professionals of record to complete design work and field review required for the project, and
 - c) provide the *authority having jurisdiction* with letters in the forms set out in Schedules [...], A-2, B-1 and B-2 (See below).

Division C B-2.4.3.

SCHEDULE A-2

Confirmation of Commitment by Owner and by Registered Professional of Record

See Subsection 2.4.3. of Division C of the Alberta Building Code

To: The authority having jurisdiction	Date:
Address	
Postal Code	
Re: Design and Field Review of Construction for the following	ng project
Name of project	
Address	
Legal description	
The owner has retained a registered professional of record to coord required for this project for:	dinate the design work and field reviews
□ architecture □ structural engineering □ electrical engineering □ geotechnical engineering	mechanical engineering ng
The registered professional of record shall coordinate the design we the project for which the registered professional of record is responsible to the Alberta Building Code (ABC) and other regulations.	nsible in order to ensure the design will
The <i>owner</i> and the <i>registered professional of record</i> have read and Part 2 of Division C, especially Subsection 2.4.3. of Division C, especially Subsection 2.4.3.	
The owner and the registered professional of record acknowledge having jurisdiction should the registered professional cease to be	
The owner understands that, should the registered professional of construction, work on the portion of the project for which the regiuntil such time a new registered professional of record is retained, Schedule A-2 is filed with the authority having jurisdiction.	stered professional is responsible will cease
The registered professional of record is a registered professional a	s defined in the ABC.

Alberta Building Code 2014 Volume 1

Division C B-5

B-2.4.3. Division C

Schedule A-2 - Continued

Registered Professional of Record	Owner
Signature	Signature
Date Note of the second of th	Date
Note: affix seals over signatures I,, have signed on behalf of	I,, have signed on behalf of
Firm	Firm
Name	Name
Address	Address
Postal Code	Postal Code

Note: 1. This letter must be submitted before issuance of a building permit.

- 2. In this letter the words in italics are defined in the Alberta Building Code.
- 3. This letter must be signed by the *owner* and the *registered professional*. If signed by an agent, a letter of appointment must be attached. If the *owner* is a corporation, the letter must be signed by a signing officer of the corporation and the signing officer must set forth their position in the corporation.
- 4. The term "substantially comply" is used in *field review* because a *registered professional* does not supervise the actual construction.
- 5. The *constructor* is responsible for safety of the public and workers at the *project* site.

The Alberta Building Code defines a registered professional as an individual who qualifies as a

- a) registered architectural professional,
- b) registered engineering professional, or
- c) licensed interior designer.

B-6 Division C

Alberta Building Code 2014 Volume 1

Division C B-2.4.3.

SCHEDULE B-1

Letter of Commitment by the Registered Professional of Record

See Subsection 2.4.3. of Division C of the Alberta Building Code

To: The authority having jurisdiction	Date:
Address	
Postal Code	•
Re: Design and Field Review of Construction for the following	ng project
Name of project Address	
Legal description	
I hereby give assurance that the design of the	
□ architectural □ structural engineering □ mechanical engineering □ electrical engineering □ geotechnical engineering	
components described on plans, specifications and other support professional in support of the application for a building permit, standard (ABC) and other regulations made pursuant to the Safety of I hereby undertake to be responsible for field review of the above as indicated on the attached "Summary of Design and Field Review of the above as indicated on the attached "Summary of Design and Field Review of the Attached "Summary o	substantially comply with the Alberta Building Codes Act. The referenced components during construction
I also undertake to notify the <i>authority having jurisdiction</i> terminated at any time during construction.	in writing if our contract for field review is

Alberta Building Code 2014 Volume 1

Division C B-7

B-2.4.3. Division C

A 4	4 4	T 4	~		•
Voha	dirlo		1 0+	ntinuec	4

Registered Professional of Record	
Signature	
Date	
Note: affix seals over signature I,, have signed on behalf of	
Firm	
Name	
Address	
Postal Code	

Note: 1. This letter must be submitted before issuance of a building permit.

- 2. In this letter the words in italics are defined in the Alberta Building Code.
- 3. This letter must be signed by the registered professional.
- 4. The *constructor* is responsible for safety of the public and workers at the *project* site.

The Alberta Building Code defines a registered professional as an individual who qualifies as a a) registered architectural professional,

- b) registered engineering professional, or
 c) licensed interior designer.

B-8 Division C

Alberta Building Code 2014 Volume 1

Division C B-2.4.3.

SCHEDULE B-2

Summary of Design and Field Review Requirements

See Subsection 2.4.3. of Division C of the Alberta Building Code

Submit	tted by: Date:
(Initial	applicable responsibilities and cross out and initial non-applicable items within the list of Code es)
ARCH	IITECTURALinitial to indicate overall responsibility
1.1	Development permit requirements and conditions
1.2	Requirements to prevent fire spread and collapse; building height, building area, building classification, street access
1.3	Spatial separation requirement; limiting distance, unprotected openings, construction characteristics
1.4	Exterior walls and roofs, including exterior glazing; dampproofing/waterproofing of walls or slabs below <i>grade</i> , wall cladding
1.5	Determining the need for fire detection, alarm notification and suppression; including emergency power and lighting
1.6	Provision for firefighting
1.7	Requirements pertaining to interconnected floor spaces and high buildings
1.8	Safety within <i>floor areas</i> ; including interim wall <i>partitions</i> and finishes, <i>access to exits</i> , <i>guards</i> and handrails, sound control, specific requirements related to function
1.9	Egress systems, occupant loads, stairs and exits
1.10	Barrier free requirements
1.11	Vertical transportation
1.12	Service facilities; horizontal and vertical service spaces
1.13	Health requirements; including functional design, i.e. washrooms, food preparation areas, swimming
	pools
1.14	Structural capacity of architectural components; including anchorage and seismic
	restraint
1.15	Site development and landscaping
1.16	Review of all applicable shop drawings
1.17	Energy Efficiency, Building Envelope; NECB 2011 or ABC 2014 Division B Section 9.36 requirements
STRU	CTURALinitial to indicate overall responsibility
2.1	Structural capacity of structural components of <i>buildings</i> ; including anchorage and seismic restraint
2.2	Structural aspects of deep foundations
2.3	Qualification of welded steel fabricators and erectors
2.4.	Review of all applicable shop drawings

Alberta Building Code 2014 Volume 1

Division C B-9

B-2.4.3. Division C

Schedule B-2 - Continued

MECH	ANICALinitial to indicate overall responsibility
3.1	HVAC Systems; including fire stopping of service penetrations and placement of fire
	dampers
3.2	Plumbing systems, including potable water system, roof and storm drainage system, sanitary drainage system
3.3	Fire Protection Systems; including automatic sprinkler and other fire suppression systems; standpipe and hose systems, evaluation of necessary water supply demand
3.4	Swimming pool mechanical systems; including pool circulation and disinfection systems, ventilation in pool areas and chlorine rooms
3.5	Medical gas piping systems
3.6	Smoke control systems in high-rise and care, treatment or detention occupancy application
3.7	Review of all applicable shop drawings
3.8	Energy Efficiency, Mechanical Systems; NECB 2011 or ABC 2014 Division B Section 9.36 requirements
3.9	Energy Efficiency, Plumbing Systems; NECB 2011 or ABC 2014 Division B Section 9.36 requirements
ELECT	TRICALinitial to indicate overall responsibility
4.1	Electrical transformers vaults, switching devices and motors, including anchorage and seismic
	restraints
4.2	Electrical system and devices; including fire stopping of penetration through fire
	separation
4.3	Fire alarms; including voice communication system
4.4	Mechanical interface with controls and alarms
4.5	Emergency power and lighting systems
4.6	Fire protection of wiring for emergency systems
4.7	Review of all applicable shop drawings
4.8	Energy Efficiency, Electrical Systems (Lighting, Electric Power & Motors); NECB 2011 requirements
	ECHNICAL
5.1	Excavation
5.2	Shoring and underpinning
5.3	Geotechnical aspects of deep foundations
5.4	Control of ground and subsurface water
5.5	Structural considerations of soil; including slope stability and seismic loading
5.6	Backfill and compaction of fill

Note:

- Schedule B-2 must be attached to B-1.
 In this letter the words in italics are defined in the Alberta Building Code.
 The constructor is responsible for safety to the public and workers at the project site.

B-10 Division C

Alberta Building Code 2014 Volume 1

Provisions of the 2014 Alberta Building Code:

The Alberta Building Code 2014 provides, inter alia:

Division C

- 2.2.2. Information Required for Proposed Work
- 2.2.2.1. General Information Required
- **1)** Sufficient information shall be provided to show that the proposed *work* will conform to this Code and whether or not it may affect adjacent property.
- **2)**Plans shall be drawn to scale and shall indicate the nature and extent of the *work* or proposed *occupancy* in sufficient detail to establish that, when completed, the *work* and the proposed *occupancy* will conform to this Code.
- **3)**When proposed *work* is changed during construction, information on the changes shall comply with requirements of this Section for proposed *work*.
- **4)**Plans and specifications shall include, so far as is applicable,
 - a) floor plans on a scale of not less than 1:100,
 - b) dimensions of all rooms,
 - c) a description of the purpose of all rooms,
 - d) the location of all walls, partitions, doorways, windows and other openings,
 - e) the finish of all floors, walls and ceilings,
 - f) the location and description of all fixed equipment, and
 - g)building sections, elevations and details sufficient to determine if the proposed work meets the requirements of this Code.

Provisions of Alberta Permit Regulation:

Terms and conditions of permit

22 A permit issuer may issue a permit for an undertaking, or part of the undertaking, and may, without limiting the generality of section 44(2) of the Act and subject to the applicable policies of the Minister and of the accredited municipality or accredited regional services commission, impose terms and conditions on the permit that are consistent with the purpose and intent of the Regulation, including, but not limited to,

- (a) requiring that permission be obtained from the permit issuer before the occupancy or use of the construction, process or activity under the permit,
- (b) setting the date on which the permit expires,
- (c) setting a condition that causes the permit to expire,
- (d) setting the period of time that the undertaking may be occupied, used or operated,
- (e) setting out the scope of the undertaking being permitted,
- (f) setting the location or locations of the undertaking being permitted,
- (g) setting the qualifications of the person responsible for the undertaking,
- (h) requiring an identification number or label to be affixed to the undertaking, and
- (i) requiring the approval of a safety codes officer before any part of the building or system is covered or concealed.

Provisions of the 2014 Alberta Building Code:

The Alberta Building Code 2014 provides, inter alia:

Division C 2.2.13. Required Notification 2.2.13.3. Change of Ownership

1) The *owner* shall give notice in writing to the *authority having jurisdiction* of an impending change in ownership.

2)A new *owner* shall provide assurance that compliance with Subsection 2.2.10. [Permits] and Sentence 2.4.3.1.(1) will continue under new ownership.